

Assessment Practices Feedback Rubric

Cathy Barrette, WSU Director of Assessment
Revised 20230531

Purpose of the rubric:

This rubric is a tool for highlighting and improving the use of good practices in student learning outcomes assessment. The descriptions in the rubric lay out the components that contribute to good practices in each section of the WSU assessment plan.

Users and uses of the rubric:

Programs can use this rubric to learn about good practices, assess their own practices, inform a redesign of their assessment plan, or identify areas in which to seek professional development.

Assessment committees might use this rubric for those purposes as well, and to provide feedback to program representatives.

The University Assessment Council uses this rubric annually to review a sample of assessment plans. We use the results to:

- Invite programs to a dialogue about their assessment practices, successes, challenges, and needs.
- Recognize programs with good assessment practices.
- Offer support, feedback, and resources for assessment.
- Inform the council's efforts to support assessment across campus.
- Provide data to the Higher Learning Commission in support of WSU's accreditation.

Organization of the rubric:

The rubric is presented as a single table for each section of WSU's assessment plan (mission statement, learning outcomes/program goals, curriculum map, assessment methods, results, action plans, timelines, stakeholder engagement). Each table presents the key components of one of those sections as a checklist, followed by descriptions of three levels of assessment practice plus a non-completion option: **Reflects best practices**, **Meets standards**, **Needs development**, and **Not submitted**. Use the checklist to help you decide on a level and then to identify ways to improve your assessment practices or reasons to celebrate them!

MISSION STATEMENT			
Which of the following components are included in the mission statement? (Check all that apply.)			
<input type="checkbox"/> The program's (not the department's) purpose (i.e., why the program exists and what the program does that distinguishes it from other units or programs).	<input type="checkbox"/> The program's key offerings (opportunities, experiences, areas of study that help program participants meet program goals).	<input type="checkbox"/> The target audience or stakeholders (types of individuals or groups that would benefit from the program). <input type="checkbox"/> A focus on learners as the primary stakeholders (e.g., wording is clear to a general audience).	<input type="checkbox"/> The mission statement was not submitted.
Which level best describes the quantity and quality of information in the mission statement? (Select one.)			
<input type="radio"/> Reflects best practices: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All components are included and are well developed. 	<input type="radio"/> Meets standards: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All or most of the components are included, but some need development. 	<input type="radio"/> Needs development (If any of the following apply): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Few or none of the components are included. • The statement is too general to distinguish it from other programs <u>or</u> it is focused on the department rather than the program. • Most or all components are included, but are vague, unclear, or lack coherence. 	<input type="radio"/> Not submitted: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The item was not submitted.
Please add any comments you'd like to share with the program's representative(s) to celebrate or help them improve their mission statement.			

LEARNING OUTCOMES AND PROGRAM GOALS

- **Program learning outcomes** are statements of what students should know, value, or be able to do by the end of their program. They apply to academic, co-curricular, and student support programs.
- **Program goals** are operational targets (e.g., retention rates, services/participation rates, satisfaction levels) that should only appear in co-curricular and student support programs, not in academic programs.

Which of the following components are included in the learning outcomes or goals? (Check all that apply.)

- | | | | |
|--|---|---|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> (For co-curricular and student support programs only): An operational goal | <input type="checkbox"/> A focus on the results of learning or participating in the program (not on the learning process, program activities, or teaching) | <input type="checkbox"/> A measurable, observable behavior using an action verb (e.g., "summarize"/ "compare"/"design", <i>not</i> "understand"/"know"/"are familiar with"/"demonstrate understanding of...") (See Bloom's taxonomy as a useful tool.) | <input type="checkbox"/> Learning outcomes were not submitted. |
| <input type="checkbox"/> A logical alignment to the mission statement | <input type="checkbox"/> A single behavior (e.g., "analyze" vs. "analyze, interpret, and report") | | |

Which level best describes the quantity and quality of information in the learning outcomes or program goals? (Select one.)

- | | | | |
|---|--|---|--|
| <input type="radio"/> Reflects best practices (if both criteria apply): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There are at least four outcomes in the assessment plan. • All outcomes meet all of the criteria OR the outcomes appear to be mandated by the program's specialized accrediting agency. | <input type="radio"/> Meets standards (if both criteria apply): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There are at least four outcomes in the assessment plan. • Most outcomes meet all of the criteria. | <input type="radio"/> Needs development (If either of the following apply): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There are fewer than four outcomes. • Few or none of the outcomes meet all of the criteria. | <input type="radio"/> Not submitted: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The item was not submitted. |
|---|--|---|--|

Please add any comments you'd like to share with the program's representative(s) to celebrate or help them improve their **learning outcomes or goals**.

CURRICULUM MAP/ACTIVITY-TO-GOAL GRID

Note: **Only academic programs are required to submit a curriculum map.** Student Support programs may optionally submit either a curriculum map or an activity-to-goal grid. If a Student Support program submits one, please rate it using the usual criteria. If a student support program does not submit one, please mark "not submitted" in the checklist and "Meets standards" in the ratings.

Which of the following components are included in the curriculum map (or grid)? (Check all that apply.)

- All** program learning outcomes are listed.
- Each course, learning opportunity, or relevant milestone/activity (e.g., qualifying exams, prospectus, defense, mentored research/event, service) is **listed individually**.

- For curriculum maps only: The **development of learning** across courses/learning opportunities is identified in each relevant course, activity, or milestone (e.g., introduction/development/mastery, 1/2/3, color-coding, *but not* X/present).

- Only one program's information** is included (e.g., BA and MA should be in separate curriculum maps). (Concentrations or tracks within a program can be combined *or* separate.)

- A curriculum map (or activity-to-goal grid) was not submitted.**

Which level best describes the quantity and quality of information in the curriculum map/activity-to-goal grid? (Select one.)

- Reflects best practices (if all criteria apply):**
 - **All** information is provided in a clear format.
 - The **development** of learning across courses/learning experiences within each outcome is **clearly indicated**.
 - Each outcome is addressed in **multiple** courses, activities, or milestones.

- Meets standards (if any criteria apply):**
 - **Most** information is provided.
 - It **takes some effort** to determine how each course, learning opportunity or milestone activity contributes to the development of learning in each outcome.
 - **For Student Support programs only:** A curriculum map or grid was **not submitted**.

- Needs development (If any of the following apply):**
 - **Little or none** of the information is provided.
 - Only a **subset** of outcomes is provided.
 - Some of the courses, activities, or milestones are **presented in groups** (e.g., all 5000-level courses) rather than individually.
 - The **development** of learning for each outcome is **not clearly indicated**.

- Not submitted:**
 - **For academic programs only:** The item was **not submitted**.

Please add any comments you'd like to share with the program's representative(s) to celebrate or help them improve their curriculum map or activity-to-goal grid.

ASSESSMENT METHODS

For the assessment methods section, you'll be evaluating three elements: the **completeness** of the methods descriptions, the **usefulness** of the data, and the **practicality** of the process. Usefulness is the most important and is inherently supported by the description.

You'll need definitions for two terms:

- **Useful data** means that the method will lead to the collection of scores, responses, results, etc., that isolate information about individual learning outcomes or goals at an appropriate level of detail to provide an indication about what the program should retain or change.
 - For example, collecting essays in a course and scoring them with a relevant rubric is likely to provide useful data about students' academic writing skills, whereas evaluating student videos of how to do calligraphy would not. Similarly, global scores such as course grades that combine or conflate performance on multiple outcomes are typically not useful by this definition. For example, a B in a course could mean that the student earned an A on LO1, a B on LO2, and a C on LO 3, or a B on all three LOs.
- A **practical method** is one that can be implemented with existing time and resources.

Most of the checklist focuses on the description of the methods, but your rating must take all three elements into account.

Which of the following components are included in the description of the assessment methods? (Check all that apply.)

- | | | | |
|--|--|---|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> What the data source is (e.g., scores from specific exams or presentations, survey results, focus group responses) | <input type="checkbox"/> The criteria for evaluating or scoring the data (e.g., accuracy of content, coding responses as criticism vs praise) | <input type="checkbox"/> The person or group responsible for reviewing the results | <input type="checkbox"/> The methods are likely to produce useful data . |
| <input type="checkbox"/> How the data are gathered (by whom, from whom) | <input type="checkbox"/> The evaluation scale (e.g., 0-100%; strongly agree to strongly disagree; the proportion of criticism to praise) | <input type="checkbox"/> The criteria or threshold for acceptable performance (e.g., an 85% pass rate; an average 75% score across all students; more praise than criticism) | <input type="checkbox"/> The methods seem practical . |
| <input type="checkbox"/> How often/when the data are gathered | | | <input type="checkbox"/> Assessment methods were not submitted . |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Who evaluates or scores the data | | | |

Which level best describes the quantity and quality of information in the assessment methods? (Select one.)

<p><input type="radio"/> Reflects best practices (if all criteria apply):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The assessment plan includes at least two methods. • All or most components of the method description are provided. • The description includes sufficient detail to easily understand whether the assessment is appropriate for measuring the target learning outcome(s). • The assessment isolates useful data. • The assessment method is practical. 	<p><input type="radio"/> Meets standards (if all criteria apply):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The assessment plan includes at least two methods. • All or most of the points are included, but some need clarification. • The assessment isolates useful data. • The assessment method is practical. 	<p><input type="radio"/> Needs development (If any of the following apply):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The assessment plan has fewer than two methods. • Little or no information is provided. Many details need clarification. • The assessment will not provide useful data. 	<p><input type="radio"/> Not submitted:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The item was not submitted.
--	--	--	---

Please add any comments you'd like to share with the program's representative(s) to celebrate or help them improve their assessment methods.

RESULTS

Which of the following components are included in the description of the results? (Check all that apply.)

A **summary** of the scores, responses, or other data, including any problems that arose.

A statement of whether the results **met or failed to meet** the threshold or criteria for acceptable performance.

A **data set** (de-identified individual learner scores, responses, etc.), either in the description or as an attachment.

Results were not submitted.

Which level best describes the quantity and quality of information in the results? (Select one.)

- Reflects best practices (if all criteria apply):**
- The assessment plan includes **at least two** results.
 - **All** information is provided and is clear.
 - The **data set** supports the summary.
 - **If applicable**, results for the current year are linked to previous years' results or action plans.

- Meets standards (if all criteria apply):**
- The assessment plan includes **at least two** results.
 - **Most** information is provided.
 - The **data set** may or may not support the summary.
 - Some details may **need clarification**.

- Needs development (If any criteria apply):**
- The assessment plan includes **fewer than two** results.
 - **Little or no** information is provided.
 - The information is **unclear**.
 - The **data set does not support** the summary.

- Not submitted:**
- The item was **not submitted**.

Please add any comments you'd like to share with the program's representative(s) to celebrate or help them improve the description of their results.

ACTION PLAN

Action plans in response to the results can vary widely. Actions **for outcomes that were met** might include continued monitoring of the same outcome or a plan to assess a different outcome next year, for example. Actions **for outcomes there were not met** might include changes to the program's curriculum, teaching methodology, assessment tools, etc. The key is for the actions to be a logical response to the assessment results.

Which of the following components are included in the program action plan? (Check all that apply.)

The plan identifies **at least one** area of the program or of the assessment plan that will be monitored, remediated, or enhanced.

The plan states **at least one logical step** to improve the program **in response to the results**. (Changes not linked to the assessment results fall outside of this description.)

The plan identifies a **person or group responsible** for carrying out the steps of the action plan.

A program action plan was not submitted.

Which level best describes the quantity and quality of information in the action plan? (Select one.)

Reflects best practices (if all criteria apply):

- The assessment plan includes **at least two** action plan sections.
- **All** information is provided and is clear.
- The chosen action(s) clearly and **logically relate** to the results.
- Actions **focus on changes the program** (not the learners) will make.

Meets standards (if all criteria apply):

- The assessment plan includes **at least two** action plan sections.
- **Most** information is provided; some information may need clarification.
- The chosen action(s) clearly and **logically relate** to the results.
- Actions **focus on changes the program** (not the learners) will make.

Needs development (If any of the following apply):

- The assessment plan includes **fewer than two** action plan sections.
- **Little or no** clear information is provided.
- The chosen action(s) **do not clearly or logically relate** to the results.
- Actions **focus on changes learners must make** rather than on changes the program will make.
- The identified action is to **make a plan at some future point**.

Not submitted:

- The item was **not submitted**.

Please add any comments you'd like to share with the program's representative(s) to celebrate or help them improve their action plan.

TIMELINE FOR IMPLEMENTATION OF THE ACTION PLAN			
Which of the following components are included in the timelines? (Check all that apply.)			
<input type="checkbox"/> The timeline sets a specific schedule for implementing the action plan.			<input type="checkbox"/> A timeline was not submitted.
Which level best describes the quantity and quality of information in the timelines? (Select one.)			
<input type="radio"/> Reflects best practices (if all criteria apply): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The assessment plan includes at least two timeline sections. All parts of the action plan have specific deadlines for implementation and completion. 	<input type="radio"/> Meets standards (if all criteria apply): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The assessment plan includes at least two timeline sections. Most parts of the action plan have specific deadlines for implementation and completion. 	<input type="radio"/> Needs development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The assessment plan includes fewer than two timelines. Few or none of the parts of the action plan have specific deadlines for implementation or completion. 	<input type="radio"/> Not submitted: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The item was not submitted.
Please add any comments you'd like to share with the program's representative(s) to celebrate or help them improve their timelines.			

STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT			
Which of the following components are included in the stakeholder engagement plan? (Check all that apply.)			
<input type="checkbox"/> One or more stakeholder groups were selected.	<input type="checkbox"/> A plan to engage at least one of the stakeholder groups in discussing any aspect of the program's assessment is described.	<input type="checkbox"/> A stakeholder engagement item was not submitted.	
Which level best describes the quantity and quality of information in the stakeholder engagement plan? (Select one.)			
<input type="radio"/> Reflects best practices (if all criteria apply): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The assessment plan includes at least one stakeholder group and one engagement plan. A stakeholder group is likely to actively provide input or feedback on at least one aspect of the program's assessment efforts. 	<input type="radio"/> Meets standards (if all criteria apply): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The assessment plan includes at least one stakeholder group and one engagement plan. The program shares information about at least one aspect of the program's assessment efforts but does not seek stakeholder input. 	<input type="radio"/> Needs development (if any apply): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The assessment plan does not include stakeholder groups or an engagement plan. The program does not share assessment information with any stakeholder group. 	<input type="radio"/> Not submitted: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The item was not submitted.
Please add any comments you'd like to share with the program's representative(s) to celebrate or help them improve their stakeholder engagement plan.			

OVERALL RATING

To help you decide on an overall rating, please review the scores you selected above for each section.

Which level best describes the overall quality of this assessment plan? (Select one.)

Reflects best practices (if all criteria apply):

- All sections were submitted.
- Most sections reflect best practices, with extra weight given to outcomes/goals, methods, results, and action plans.

Meets standards (if both criteria apply):

- At least the mission, outcomes/goals, methods, results, action plans were submitted.
- Most sections meet standards, with extra weight given to outcomes/goals, methods, results, and action plans.

Needs development (if any apply):

- Not all sections were submitted.
- Most sections were rated as "needs development". (Give extra weight given to outcomes/goals, methods, results, and action plans.)

Please add any comments you'd like to share with the program's representative(s) about the strengths in their assessment practices and opportunities for improvement.